

MINUTES
BUILT HERITAGE EXPERTS PANEL MEETING
April 18, 2019– 12:00 p.m. – Conference Room A

Present: Glenn Barnes, NLAA, MRAIC, Chair
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Ann-Marie Cashin, Planner III, Urban Design and Heritage
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor
Rachael Fitkowski – Landscape Architect
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor
Robert Sweeny – Historian
Mark Whelan, HW Architecture
Dawn Boutilier, Planner
Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant

Regrets: Bruce Blackwood, Contractor

ADOPTION OF AGENDA AND MINUTES

Agenda

Moved – Robert Sweeny; Seconded – Garnet Kindervater

That the agenda be adopted with the following additions:

- a. **36 Monkstown Road**
- b. **Streamlining Maintenance Applications for Designated Heritage Buildings**
- c. **Comments from Robert Sweeney**
- d. **Rawlins Cross Traffic Pilot Survey**

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Minutes

Moved – Rachel Fitkowski; Seconded by Mark Whalen

That the minutes of March 27, 2019 be adopted as presented

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

DELEGATIONS

Mr. Peter Jackson, Architect re: Decision Note dated April 12, 2019 re: 331 Water Street (At Bishop's Cove) Office and Retail Building

The Panel welcomed Mr. Peter Jackson to the meeting to discuss the above-noted topic.

The City has received an application for the development of an office and retail building at 331 Water Street. The proposed development will be approximately 4,180m² (45,000 ft²), three storeys in height at Water Street and will include two levels of parking off Bishop's Cove and Harbour Drive.

The subject property is located in Heritage Area 1, the Commercial Downtown District of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Commercial Central Retail (CCR). Both office and retail stores are permitted uses within the CCR Zone. In addition to being in Heritage Area 1, the property is located adjacent to the Murray Premises National Historic Site of Canada, and within the vicinity of a number of St. John's designated Heritage Buildings and the Water Street National Historic District.

Discussion resulted in the following comments by Panel Members.

- The site is located in Heritage Area 1 and is in the area of many designated heritage buildings. The site should be viewed as the gateway to a prominent heritage area
- Does little to demonstrate the passion for heritage.
- Is not respectful to the core of downtown St. John's
- Lacks a sense of connection.
- Site is perfect to make an iconic heritage building
- Can't always be pushed by modern structures - the public gets nothing back in terms of the heritage we boast about.
- So many elements that could inspire a modern design
- Massive glass wall is too much - should be more subtle
- Lacks rhythm of the downtown
- There is a lack of continuity of lines
- There is a need to engage in conversation of architectural elements within the block.

While the Panel concurred with the recommendation of staff to reject the application as it exists, the applicant agreed to seek position of client to see if it wishes to revise and bring back to the Panel prior to bringing it to Council for a decision.

NEW BUSINESS

- a. Decision Note dated April 15, 2019 re: Metal Roofs and Solar Panels in the St. John's Heritage Areas.**
-

The Panel was requested to discuss options for energy efficient retrofits on buildings in the St. John's Heritage Areas, specifically the use of metal roofs and solar panels.

As older buildings are renovated, many residents and property owners are looking for ways to make their buildings more energy efficient. The City wishes to encourage adaptive re-use of buildings in the Heritage Areas, and therefore the City is seeking ways to strike a balance between preserving the heritage and character defining elements of a buildings and allowing renovations to make the building more energy efficient. In particular, the use of metal roofs and solar panels are brought to the Panel for discussion and recommendation. This discussion is limited to buildings in the Heritage Area and does not include designated Heritage Buildings because any renovation to a designated Heritage Building would be assessed on its own merit and require Council's approval

Recommendation

Moved by Mark Whalen; Seconded by Dawn Boutlier

That the following apply to the use of modern materials in heritage areas:

- **Shingles for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style**
- **Solar Panels will be permitted as long as they are not visible from the street.**

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

b. Decision Note dated April 17, 2019 re: Streamlining Maintenance Applications for Designated Heritage Buildings

As stated in the above-noted Decision Note, the Panel was requested to determine an appropriate process to streamline general maintenance applications for designated heritage buildings.

To date, the process for evaluating any repairs to a designated heritage building has been an initial staff review, followed by a referral (i.e. Decision Note) to the Built Heritage Experts Panel (BHEP). The Panel's recommendation then goes to a Committee of the Whole Meeting and then to a Council Meeting for a decision. Depending on when the application is submitted in relation to the next BHEP meeting, this process can take anywhere from four to seven weeks. In cases where a building requires emergency repairs, or the repairs are purely maintenance, this is a lengthy process. While we do try to expediate applications for minor repairs through e-vote, and requests for the application to go directly to a Council meeting, these are exceptions and not the rule.

To accelerate the current process, staff is recommending that minor maintenance applications for designated heritage buildings be evaluated by staff and sent directly to a Council meeting for Council's approval. This would include applications for such things as repairs to shingles or roof flashings, re-pointing or re-painting of the building, or replacement of windows or doors in the same style and proportion of the existing. Generally, this is simply a replacement or repair of an existing feature. It is recommended that any applications that would alter the building or character defining elements of the building would follow the existing process of being referred to the BHEP for a recommendation to Council.

Recommendation

Moved by Robert Sweeny; Seconded by Dawn Boutilier

That minor maintenance applications for designated heritage buildings be evaluated by staff and sent directly to a Council meeting for Council's approval.

Further, that any applications that would alter the building or character defining elements of the building will follow the existing process of being referred to the BHEP for a recommendation to Council.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

c. Decision Note dated April 17, 2019 re: 36 Monkstown Road, Designated Heritage Building, Exterior Renovations

The City has received an application for exterior renovations to a designated heritage building located at 36 Monkstown Road. The renovations include repairs to four chimneys, two dormer windows, and mouldings on the front porch.

The subject property is located within Heritage Area 2, the Residential Low Density District of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Residential Low Density (R1). The building is designated by Council as a Heritage Building. As per Section 355 (2) of the City of St. John's Act, Council's approval is required for any alterations to the exterior of a building designated by Council.

The repairs described in the application are maintenance repairs and will not alter the character-defining elements of the building. The repairs to the chimney include repointing and repairs to the roof flashing, while the repairs to the dormer windows are to prevent leaking. Similarly, the repairs to the front porch will only repaint and repair existing mouldings. As the repairs will not impact the historic elements of the building

and will help to ensure the building is maintained, it is recommended to approve the application for repairs to 36 Monkstown Road.

Recommendation

Moved by Robert Sweeny; Seconded by Garnet Kindervater

That the application for repairs to the chimney, dormer windows and porch located at 36 Monkstown Road be approved as submitted.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

d. Rawlins Cross Traffic Pilot Survey

Ann Marie Cashin reminded the Panel of the survey requesting feedback on the Rawlins Cross Pilot Project and invited input from members. While it is felt that from a vehicular perspective the project is favorable, concern for safety of pedestrians was expressed. The Panel is interested in the results.

e. Membership on the Panel – Robert Sweeny

Robert informed the Panel of his family's decision relocate to Montreal. He indicated his house is for sale and his continuation on the Panel will be dependent on this sale.

The Panel expressed disappointment in the loss of Robert's contribution to the Panel but wished him every measure of success.

Adjournment and Date for Next Meeting

The meeting adjourned at 1:50 pm. The date of the next meeting May 15, 2019.

**Glenn Barnes, NLAA, MRAIC
Chairperson**