

ST. JOHN'S

Minutes of Built Heritage Experts Panel

June 12, 2019

Present: Glenn Barnes, Chairperson
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor
Dawn Boutilier, Planner
Mark Whalen, Architecture
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor

Regrets: Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect
Jamie Freeman - Legal Department - Observer

Others:

ADOPTION OF THE MINUTES - May 15, 2019

The Panel felt that Council approved 331 Water Street with limited regard to the Panel's recommendation. Where heritage is an important issue that Council deals with on an ongoing basis, the Panel offers to hold an information session with Council.

Mark Whalen joined the meeting at 12:21 pm.

Recommendation

Moved By Bruce Blackwood

Seconded By Garnet Kindervater

That the minutes of May 15, 2019 be adopted as presented.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

4. DELEGATIONS

4.1 Decision Note dated June 5, 2019 re: Application to Develop a Multi-Purpose Annex - St. John's Designated Heritage Building, 16 Church Hill, DEV1900091

The Panel discussed staff's report that while there has been modest change in the drawings presented to the Panel on May 15, 2019, the applicant has requested another opportunity to articulate its position with a request that a decision note to be advanced to Council.

It was noted by the Panel that although this proposed development has been under review by the Anglican Cathedral, it has only been under consideration by the Panel as of May 2019.

Staff clarified that the development approval for this project is currently under review by the City concurrent with consideration of the building design only being referred to the Panel.

The Panel welcomed Mr. Greg Snow, Mr. Paul Antle (member of the congregation) and Steve Smith - Project Manager.

Discussion took place with suggestions on design that would complement the character of the neighboring properties and the Cathedral. While the Panel was appreciative of the modest changes since its last presentation in May, the applicant was receptive to further adjustments that would evoke a more complimentary connection to the Cathedral.

The delegation retired from the meeting at 1:30 pm at which time the Panel formulated the following recommendation.

Recommendation

Moved By Garnet Kindervater

Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

While staff has recommended rejection of the application as presented, the Panel, having considered the input of the delegation applauds the following:

- design that works with the slope of the land
- subordinate scale in relation to the Cathedral
- placement of building away from trees
- protection of trees

The Panel also recommends the following changes as discussed with the applicant who was receptive to such recommendations.

- removal of exterior sunshades
- the use of natural stone, as much as possible, around the perimeter, matching the Cathedral
- consideration of glass that will highly reflect the surroundings
- reconsideration of the composite aluminum panel with material that more muted in its appearance

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. BUSINESS ARISING FROM THE MINUTES

5.1 Decision Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Metal Roofs and Solar Panels in the St. John's Heritage Areas

This matter was before the Panel in April at which time Committee of the Whole required clarification of the Panel's position, given that the original decision note and the Panel's recommendation where in mild conflict.

Discussion concluded with agreement that the following recommendation be brought forward.

Recommendation

Moved By Mark Whalen

Seconded By Bruce Blackwood

That the following apply to the use of modern roof materials in heritage areas:

- Shingle-style metal roofs for residential dwellings will be permitted subject to the material replicating heritage style. Non-residential buildings may be permitted other styles of metal roofs if the style replicates the existing roof style.
- Solar Panels will be permitted as long as they are not visible from the street.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5.2 Information Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Door and Garage Door Styles in Heritage Areas

Given time constraints of the meeting the above-noted matter was deferred to the next meeting.

5.3 Decision Note dated June 10, 2019 re: 6 Cathedral Street, Masonic Temple Renovations - Exterior Renovations

The Panel was reminded that the applicant was present at the January 2019 meeting to present the concept of proposed renovations to the Masonic Temple.

An application has now been received and is before the Panel for consideration. The Panel agrees with the staff recommendation to approve, but with two (2) conditions.

Recommendation

Moved By Dawn Boutilier

Seconded By Mark Whalen

That Council approve the exterior renovations and installation of a fire exit stairway on the Masonic Temple, located at 6 Cathedral Street subject to the following:

- Replacement of glass on the north side, where the stairwell is proposed, should be done with non-wired type, fire-rated glass.
- The color of the proposed wooden stairway should match the existing brick work and stained in accordance with manufacturer's specifications.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 1:54 pm.

Glenn Barnes, Chair

