

## Built Heritage Experts Panel

**Date:** May 15, 2019  
**Time:** 12:00 pm  
**Location:** 4th Floor, City Hall

Members Present Glenn Barnes, Chairperson  
Bruce Blackwood, Contractor  
Garnet Kindervater, Contractor  
Rachel Fitkowski, Landscape Architect  
Mark Whalen, Architecture  
Robert Sweeny, Historian  
Ken O'Brien, Chief Municipal Planner  
Ann Marie Cashin, Heritage and Urban Planner  
Rob Schamper, Technical Advisor  
Maureen Harvey, Legislative Assistant  
Shanna Fitzgerald, Legislative Assistant

Regrets: Dawn Boutilier, Planner

### Adoption of Agenda

**Moved By** Rachel Fitkowski  
**Seconded By** Mark Whalen

That the agenda be adopted as presented.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### Delegations

#### **Mr. Peter Jackson, 331 Water Street**

---

The Panel was reminded of Mr. Jackson's attendance at the April meeting. Subsequent to that meeting, Mr. Jackson was provided with the comments and recommendations of the panel. While he has not yet provided revised drawings incorporating those recommendations, to staff he showed a willingness to incorporate many of the features discussed i.e revise the Water Street façade and reduce the amount of glass.

Mr. Jackson was welcomed to the meeting and presented a revised rendering which addressed some of the comments of the Panel at its last meeting.

Discussion took place with the following suggestions brought forward:

- Installation of a cornice along the top of the building facing Water Street.
- Add windowsills to the second storey windows on Water Street (similar to the surrounding buildings).
- Ensure first storey windows on Water Street align with adjacent buildings.
- The amount of brick shown on the drawings will remain brick in the final design.
- The “fin” along the rooftop should be angled at its rear edge facing Harbour Drive to evoke the mansard roof of the Murray Premises.

Other suggestions included:

- The design should include bike racks (potentially along Harbour Drive).
- Public art should be displayed along the brick wall facing the Murray Premises (5 Beck’s Cove).
- There is an opportunity to provide a covered pedestrian arcade along Bishop’s Cove by extending the overhang.

Mr. Jackson left the meeting at 12:35 following which time the Panel agreed that Ann Marie will prepare a Decision Note which will be sent to the Panel by way of an E-poll.

**Mr. Paul Chafe, 68 Queen’s Road – Decision Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Rezoning Application for a 40-unit Residential Development – MPA 1900002, 68 Queen’s Road (Cathedral Parish Hall), Designated Heritage Building.**

---

The Panel reviewed the Decision Note and considered staff’s comments in relation to the application. It was noted that the applicant wishes to demolish a portion of the building.

The application has been considered by Council for rezoning and the applicant is required to prepare a Land Use Assessment Report (LUAR).

Given the unfavourable experience of the Panel in dealing with Richmond Cottage it was suggested, that a disassembly and rebuilding plan should

be submitted. It was also suggested that the applicant make use of repurposed material from the demolition. The applicant will be providing more information on the disassembly plan and reuse of materials in the LUAR.

While the Panel may consider demolition of the unoriginal portions of the Parish Hall, it sees the east entrance as an opportunity to re-create something on the top that will bring back more of the original form. It also suggests the use of red brick and further improvements on the massing.

Staff reported that once the LUAR is completed further discussion with the Panel will be scheduled prior to the matter being introduced at Council.

It appears the Panel is open to de-designation of the Parish Hall but would like to look further into assurances on the implementation of the applicant's plan through legal documentation. Staff will refer the matter to the City's Legal Department for further input.

Mr. Paul Chafe welcomed to the meeting and presented revised renderings for the project noting that Phase 1 contains 25 housing units while Phase II contains 15 units. It is the intent to retain the house, demolish the Parish Hall and deconstruct/re-create the archway. The applicant intends to use some materials from the demolition.

The Panel expressed concern that it needs assurance that the work being proposed can, indeed, be carried out. If demolition of the Parish Hall proceeds, it wants assurance that the other buildings can be retained, supported and secured if it is to lead in to Phase II of the project.

Mr. Chafe was thanked for his input and advised the matter will be revisited by the Panel upon receipt of the LUAR. The Panel would like to review the LUAR prior to making any recommendation on amending the heritage designation of the building.

**Mr. Greg Snow – 16 Church Hill – Information Note dated May 8, 2019 re: Application to Develop a Multi-purpose Annex – St. John's Designated Heritage Building, Cathedral of St. John the Baptist, 16 Church Hill**

The Panel was informed Gibbons + Snow Architects, on behalf of the property owner, the Anglican Cathedral of St. John the Baptist, has applied to develop an extension to the Cathedral. The new annex will contain church offices, a multi-purpose room and other related functions.

The subject property is located in Heritage Area 1, the Institutional and Open Space Districts of the St. John's Municipal Plan and is zoned Institutional (INST) and Cemetery(CEM). The Anglican Cathedral of St. John the Baptist is a City of St. John's Designated Heritage Building.

Mr. Snow was welcomed to the meeting. He stated this proposal has been under consideration by the Diocese for the last few years. In short, the Diocese wants to consolidate functions that are currently spread throughout other areas of the City.

The application was initially made to the City in 2017 but was placed on hold as more information was required. The applicants are now resuming the application and are presenting the design to the Built Heritage Experts Panel for feedback.

The Panel reviewed the renderings of the proposed structure and which includes church offices, a multi-purpose room and other rooms for related functions.

The Panel felt that the overall structure is a departure of other structures in heritage areas and it lacked character that blends in with the surrounding area. If constructed, it would detract from the heritage of surrounding buildings. It was felt the building in its current design competes instead of compliments the Cathedral.

Discussion resulted in the following suggestions:

- The design should incorporate features of the Cathedral and structures in the neighbourhood
- Confirmation will be required to ensure that the development does not impact the remains that may be in the adjacent cemetery.
- The design is ultra-modern with nothing that speaks to heritage or the neighbourhood.
- The building should draw inspiration from the Cathedral.
- Concern with sunshading.

While he felt the Diocese may not want to change the design, for which many resources have already been expended, he agreed to bring the comments of the Panel back to the owner for further review.

## **Adoption of Minutes**

**Minutes of April 18, 2019**

---

**Moved By** Garnet Kindervater  
**Seconded By** Rachel Fitkowski

That the minutes of the BHEP meeting held April 18, 2019 be adopted as presented.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

### **Business Arising**

Decision Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Metal Roofs and Solar Panels in St. John's Heritage Areas.

---

This matter was deferred due to time constraints.

### **New Business**

Information Note dated May 6, 2019 re: Door and Garage Door Styles in Heritage Areas.

---

This matter was deferred due to time constraints

Heritage Financial Grants

---

It was agreed that the Panel would review and consider a decision note regarding the Heritage Financial Grants by way of an e-poll. If approved by the Panel, the matter will be referred to Committee of the Whole.

### **Adjournment and Next Meeting**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at approximately 2:10 pm.

---

Glenn Barnes  
Chairperson